[*Proceedings of the Evaluators' Forum*, April 21st – 24th, 1991, Les Rasses, Vaud, Switzerland; ed. Kirsten Falkedal (Geneva: ISSCO).]

Measuring Compositionality of Transfer

Björn Gämback & Manny Rayner Swedish Institute of Computer Science

Hiyan Alshawi & David Carter SRI International Cambridge Research Centre

Reading the literature on machine translation, one can find a number of criteria mentioned as significant when evaluating the worth of a transfer formalism; among these are *expressiveness, simplicity, generality, reversibility, language-independence, monotonicity* and *compositionality*. Unfortunately, one soon learns, when trying to convince others of the worth of one's own approach, that most of these are not easy to measure objectively, if they are not absolute properties of the formalism. (In particular, a pure unification-based formalism is guaranteed to be monotonic). To say, for example, that a formalism is "good" from the point of view of expressiveness, and then back this up with five carefully-chosen examples, is not really to say very much.

However, compositionality is an important exception. Here, we will describe a simple method for evaluating the compositionality of a transfer-based MT system, and give an example of its use in the context of the BCI (Bidirectional Conversation Interpreter), an interactive transfer-based bidirectional system currently being developed in a co-operation between SICS and SRI Cambridge. The main components of the BCI are English and Swedish versions of the SRI Core Language Engine, transfer taking place at the level of Quasi Logical Form (QLF); the transfer formalism is unification-based and bidirectional.

For compositionality to be a meaningful notion in the first place, it must be possible for transfer rules to apply to partial structures. These structures can consequently occur in different contexts; other transfer rules will apply to the contexts. The question is the extent to which particular combinations of rules and contexts give rise to special problems. In a perfectly compositional system, this will never happen; however, it seems a safe bet to guess that no such system exists today. What we want is a method which measures how closely we approach the compositional ideal.

Our first step in this direction has been the construction of *compositionality tables*, in which a set of rules and a set of contexts are systematically combined in all possible meaningful combinations. In the following three diagrams, we give an example of such a table for the current version of the BCI. Table 1 gives a set of rules, which exemplify six common types of complex transfer. Table 2 gives a set of twelve common types of context in which the constructions referred to by the rules can occur. Finally, Table 3 summarizes the results of testing the various possible combinations. Each square in the table consists of two entries, the first for the Swedish-English, and the second for the English-Swedish direction. The entries are to be interpreted as follows:

- NA means that the combination was not applicable, i.e. that the contraction referred to by the rule cannot occur in this context.
- OK means that analysis, transfer and generation all functioned correctly, without any extra rule being necessary to deal with the particular context.
- Swe/Eng grammar means that processing (either analysis or generation) failed due to a shortcoming in that language's grammar and/or lexicon.
- **transfer fails** means that the transfer component was unable to make a correct transfer.
- All other entries are names of rules needed to deal with special combinations of rule and context. For this table, only three extra rules were needed: pres-not, which adjusts the relative scope of the operators for negation and the present tense; past-not, which performs a similar function for the past tense; and pres-mod, which rescopes VP modifiers with respect to the present tense operator. No more than one rule is needed to deal with any single example.

At the workshop, we would discuss in more detail the use of this technique, and our experiences in using it to debug and develop the BCI.

Complex transfer type	English-S	English-Swedish example
Different particles	John likes Mary	John tycker om Mary
Passive to active	Issurance is included	Pörsäkring ingår
Verb to adjective	John owes Mary \$20	John är skyldig Mary \$20
Support verb to normal verb John had an accident	John had an accident	John råkade ut för en olycka
Single verb to phinie	John wants a car	John vill ha en bil
		(lit.: "wante to have")
Idiomatic use of PP	John is in a hurry	John har bråttom
		(lit.: "has hurty")

Table 1: EXAMPLES OF COMPLEX TRANSFER TYPES

Transfer context	Englis	English-Swedish example
Perfect tente	John has liked Mary	John har tyckt om Mary
Negated	John docan't like Mary	John tycker inte om Mary
YN-question	Docs John like Mary!	Tycker John om Maty!
WH-question	Who does John like?	Vem tycker John om?
Passive	Mary was liked by John	Mary bler omlyckt ar John
Relative clause	The woman that John likes	Krinuan som John tycker om
Sentential complement	I know that John likes Mary	Jag vet att John tycker om Mary
Embedded question	I know who John likes	Jag vet vem John tycker om
VP modifier	John likes Mary today	John tycker om Mary idag
Object raising	I want John to like Mary	Jeg vill att John ska tycka om Mary (lit.: "I want that John shall like Mary")
Change of aspect	John stopped liking Mary	John slutade tycks om Mary (lit.: "John stopped like-INF Mary")

Table 2: EXAMPLES OF TRANSFER CONTEXTS

(Swedish English Over English Swedish) it Different Support verb Single verb it Different Particles edjective Corr Support verb is phree 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 <t< th=""><th></th><th></th><th>Con</th><th>Compositionality Table</th><th>-ble</th><th></th><th></th></t<>			Con	Compositionality Table	-ble		
IderDifferentPaniterieVerb toSupport verbSingle verbextparticlesactiveedjectiveto aormal verbto phraseext0K0K0K0K0K0Kext0K0K0K0K0K0Kext0K0K0K0K0K0Kext0KBargrammar0K0K0K0Kext0K0K0K0K0K0Kext0K0K0K0K0K0Kpressaot0K0K0K0K0K0Kioa0K0K0K0K0K0Kioa0K0K0K0K0K0Kioa0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K0K0Kina0K0K0K0K </th <th></th> <th> </th> <th>(Swedish-En</th> <th>iglish over Engli</th> <th>sh-Swedish)</th> <th></th> <th></th>			(Swedish-En	iglish over Engli	sh-Swedish)		
particlas active adjective to active objective to active opject ext OK OK OK OK OK OK OK ext OK OK OK OK OK OK OK ext OK Ext frammar OK Ext frammar OK OK ext OK Ext frammar OK Ext frammar OK OK pressor OK OK OK OK OK OK OK OK OK OK OK OK OK	Trasfer	Different	Passive to	Verb to	Support verb	Single verb	Idiomatic
eat0K0K0K0K0Ke0K0K0K0K0K0Ke0KEatgrammar0KEatgrammar0Ke0KEatgrammar0KEatgrammar0Ke0KEatgrammar0KEatgrammar0Ke0KEatgrammar0K0K0Ke0K0K0K0K0Ke0K0K0K0K0K0K0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K0K0K0K0K0a0K<	context	particles	active	adjective	to mormal verb	to phrase	use of PP
e OK OK OK OK DK OK CK Enggrammar OK OK Enggrammar OK OK Enggrammar OK OK DK OK OK DK OK	Present	oK	оК	оК	οK	оК	oK
etclOKBarg frammarOKBarg frammarOKoOKBarg frammarOKEarg frammarOKoOKDereraolpretraolpretraolpretraolblocdpretraolpretraolpretraolpretraolpretraolblocdOKOKOKOKOKblocdOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOKbloanOKOKOKOKOK <tr< th=""><th>teste</th><th>oK</th><th>OK</th><th>оК</th><th>oK</th><th>оК</th><th>оК</th></tr<>	teste	oK	OK	оК	oK	оК	оК
e OK Eargrammer OK Eargrammer OK Eargrammer OK Ited pres-mot pres-mot pres-mot pres-mot pres-mot Ited pres-mot pres-mot pres-mot pres-mot pres-mot Ited pres-mot DK OK OK OK OK Iten OK OK OK OK OK OK Iten OK OK OK OK OK OK Itee Swe frammat NA NA NA NA NA Itee Swe frammat NA NA NA OK OK Itee OK OK OK OK OK OK OK Itee Swe frammat NA NA NA NA OK Itee Swe frammat OK OK OK OK OK Itee OK OK OK OK OK OK	Perfect	оК	Bag grammar	ОК	Eng grammar	оК	OK
ltedpress notpress notpress notpress notpress not 0	lente	οK	Eng grammar	0K	Eng grammar	OK	оК
pretraotpretraotpretraotpretraotpretraot $0K$ <th>Negaled</th> <th>pres-not</th> <th>presentot</th> <th>pres-not</th> <th>past-not</th> <th>pres-not</th> <th>transfer fails</th>	Negaled	pres-not	presentot	pres-not	past-not	pres-not	transfer fails
0K $0K$		pres-not	pres-not	pres-not	patt-not	pres-nol	transfer fails
OKNANANANANAOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOKOKOKOKIOKOK <td< th=""><th>YN.</th><th>οK</th><th>оК</th><th>оК</th><th>oK</th><th>0K</th><th>οK</th></td<>	YN.	οK	оК	оК	oK	0K	οK
0K $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ re $Sme grammar$ NA NA NA NA NA $0K$ re $Sme grammar$ NA NA NA NA $0K$ re $0K$ e $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ e $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $oldedd$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $oldedd$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $edded$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $0K$ $fer0K0K0K0K0Kfer0K0K0K0K0Kfer0K0K0K0K0Kfer0K0K0K0K0Kfer0K0K0K0K0Kfer0K0K0K0K0Kfer0K0K0K0K0Kfer0K0K0K0K0K$	gaestion	oK	oК	оК	oK	оК	оК
OKOKOKOKOKOKSwe frammarNANANANANASwe frammarNANANANANAOKedOKOKOKOKOKoKOKOKOKOKOKofOKOKOKOKOKofOKOKOKOKOKofOKEaggrammerOKEag grammerOKOKEag grammerOKOKOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKOKEag grammarOK	WB.	oК	OK	0 K	оК	оК	oK
Swe grammarNANANANANAOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKalOKOKOKOKOKoKOKOKOKOKOKdOKOKOKOKOKdOKOKOKOKOKdOKOKOKOKOKofOKOKOKOKOKofOKOKOKOKOKofOKOKOKOKOKofOKOKOKOKOKofOKEag grammarOKEag grammarOKoKOKEag grammarOKOKOKOKEag grammarOKEag grammarOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKEag grammarOKOKOKEag grammarOK	question	οK	OK	оК	oK	оК	οK
OKNAOKNAOKOKOKOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKEaggrammarOKOKAlOKEaggrammarOKOKOKAlOKOKEaggrammarOKOKAlOKOKEaggrammarOKOKAlOKOKEaggrammarOKOKAlOKOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOKAlOKOKOKOK	Passive	Swe grammar	NN	٧N	NA	NA	NA
0K0K0K0K0K0Kal0K0K0K0K0K0Kl0K0K0K0K0K0Ked0K0K0K0K0K0Ked0K0K0K0K0K0Ked0K0K0K0K0K0Kof0K0K0K0K0K0Kof0K0K0K0K0K0Kof0K0K0K0K0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0KEaggrammar0Kof0KEaggrammar0KEaggrammar0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar0K0Kof0KEagframmar0K0Kof0KEaggrammar </th <th></th> <th>oK</th> <th>NA</th> <th>оК</th> <th>N A</th> <th>оК</th> <th>NA</th>		oK	NA	оК	N A	оК	NA
aseOKOKOKOKOKtentialOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKpressmodtransfer failspressmodOKPressmodbeddedOKBag grammarOKBag grammarOKbeddedOKBag grammarOKOKOKbed finertransfer failstransfer failstransfer failsbectOKBag grammarOKOKbectOKBag grammarOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOKbectOKOKOKOK <th>Relative</th> <th>ок</th> <th>ок</th> <th>ок</th> <th>оК</th> <th>оК</th> <th>оК</th>	Relative	ок	ок	ок	оК	оК	оК
tentialOKOKOKOKOKaplementOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKationOKOKOKOKOKationOKOKOKOKOKationOKOKOKOKOKationDre-modtransfer failspre-modOKPre-moddifierpre-modtransfer failspre-modOKpre-modange ofOKBag grammarOKBag grammarOKectOKEag grammarOKEag grammarOKjecttransfer failstransfer failstransfer failstransfer failsinnOKBag grammarOKOKOKjecttransfer failstransfer failstransfer failsinnOKBag grammarOKOKjectOKOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOKinnOKOKOK	ciause	OK	OK	οK	oK	оК	οK
nplementOKOKOKOKOKbeddedOKOKOKOKOKstionOKOKOKOKOKstionOKOKOKOKOKstionOKOKOKOKOKpres-modtransfer failspres-modOKPres-moddifierpres-modtransfer failspres-modOKpres-modange ofOKBag grammarOKBug grammarOKcotOKBag grammarOKBug grammarOKjocttransfer failstransfer failstransfer failstransfer failsoKBag grammarOKOKOKOK	Sentential	oK	оК	оК	oK	оК	oK
beddedOKOKOKOKOKstionOKOKOKOKOKstionOKOKOKOKOKpre-modtransfer failepre-modOKpre-moddifierpre-modtransfer failepre-modOKpre-modange ofOKBag grammarOKBag grammarOKectOKEag grammarOKBag grammarOKjecttransfer failetransfer failetransfer failetransfer faileoctOKBag grammarOKOKOKjectOKBag grammarOKOKoctOKBag grammarOKOK	complement	оК	оК	οК	oK	οK	оК
ation OK OK OK OK OK OK OK OK presemod transfer fails presemod OK presemod difier presemod transfer fails presemod OK presemod ange of OK Bag grammar OK Bug grammar OK ect OK Eag grammar OK Bug grammar OK ject transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails OK OK OK	Embedded	oK	оК	оК	οK	oK	oK
difierpres-modtransfer failspres-modOKpres-moddifierpres-modtransfer failspres-modOKpres-modange ofOKBag grammarOKBag grammarOKectOKEng grammarOKEng grammarOKfocttransfer failstransfer failstransfer failstransfer failsfoctOKBag grammarOKOKfocttransfer failstransfer failstransfer failsfoctOKBag grammarOKOK	question	оК	οK	OK	oK	оК	οK
of DK Baggrammar OK Pres-mod OK Baggrammar OK Buggrammar OK OK Enggrammar OK Baggrammar OK transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails OK DK OK OK OK OK	VP	pret-mod	transfer fails	pres-mod	оК	pres-mod	pres-mod
of OK Baggrammar OK Buggrammar OK OK Enggrammar OK Enggrammar OK transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails OK Enggrammar OK OK OK	modifier	presemod	transfer fails	pres-mod	oK	pres-mod	pres-mod
OK Enggrammer OK Enggrammer OK transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails OK Enggrammer OK OK	Change of	oK	Bag grammar	ок	Bag grammar	oK	оК
transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails transfer fails OK OK OK	* pect	оК	Eng grammar	ОК	Eng grammar	OK	οK
OK Bargrammar OK OK OK	Object	transfer fails	transfer fails	transfer fails	transfer fails	transfer fails	transfer fails
	raising	oK	Bag grammar	ОК	οK	OK	оК

Table 3: A COMPOSITIONALITY TABLE