

# **“Buying up to falling down”: a deductive approach to teaching post-editing**

**Judith Belam**

University of Exeter  
Foreign Language Centre  
Exeter  
United Kingdom  
J.M.Belam@ex.ac.uk

## **Abstract**

A course in machine-assisted translation at final-year undergraduate level is the subject of the paper. The course includes a workshop session during which students compile a list of post-editing guidelines to make a text suitable for use in a clearly defined situation, and the paper describes this workshop and considers its place in the course and its future development. Issues of teaching MT to language learners are discussed.

## **1 Introduction**

Our course in machine-assisted translation at the University of Exeter is now about to start its third year. It is for final-year undergraduates, about to take their first degree in modern languages. The MT course forms an option in final year, worth 15 credits of a 120-credit course.

It seems to be unusual to teach MT to language learners at this level. They have no background in computing and are not trainee translators or even postgraduates in translation. Some would even object to exposing language learners to the incorrect models which form an inevitable part of the study of MT. I do not believe, however, that this drawback outweighs the possible advantages (Belam, 2002). Some examples of teaching MT to language learners, and its possible benefits, are discussed by Somers (2001). Derek Lewis also pointed out how an MT course can be of benefit to language learners: “many students have expressed the view that they have increased their cognitive knowledge of German grammar through having to enter information in the system’s dictionaries; for those students whose command of formal grammar is weak, the MT dictionaries appear to provide a stimulus for researching areas of basic grammatical structure.” (Lewis, 1997). In this paper I would like to explore these benefits further by showing how the inclusion of post-editing in an MT course is appropriate for language learners. It can be shown to help their language learning and their translation skills at an appropriate level, and it also

helps their awareness of the communicative aspects of language, and gives them a perspective on the use of foreign languages in the workplace.

## **2 The place of post-editing in the MT course**

Post-editing has been part of the course from the beginning but it was included at first rather as a supplementary element than a core part of the syllabus. The course aimed mainly at teaching students how to handle the software, and concentrated on how to get the best from MT raw output, with sections on choosing appropriate materials to translate, pre-editing and creation of dictionaries to improve the raw output. There was a tendency to look upon post-editing as a kind of last resort, the final solution for any problem that could not be solved in other ways; almost like cheating. After devising ever more sophisticated pre-editing rules and adding words and phrases to the dictionary, any remaining problems just had to be dealt with by post-editing. It was almost an admission of defeat.

It does deserve, however, to be treated as a topic in its own right. Sharon O’Brien has shown the importance of teaching post-editing to translators (O’Brien 2002), underlining not only its importance in the translation workflow process but also the fact that it is a separate skill which needs to be acquired separately. We also found this year that students were particularly interested in it and requested that extra time should be spent on it.

This is partly because the group doing this MT course seems to have a tendency to develop collective enthusiasms. In the first year they were all interested in syntactic issues and pre-editing; this year post-editing was the theme. I think, however, that there were two other reasons as well. Firstly they are asked to do an evaluation of an MT system as assessed project work, and time and effort spent post-editing is a good concrete measure of translation quality. Secondly, post-editing brings the human versus machine translation comparison into sharp focus. If you want to know exactly what the gap is between MT output and human translation, you cannot do better than to set out to actually bridge that gap by post-editing.

### 3 Post-editing in class

We have extremely limited time to do our course, as we have to fit it into one semester. There is one lecture on post-editing, organised around some basic principles of post-editing and how to measure how much you do. The required pre-course reading is Jeffrey Allen (2003) and also recommended is Hans Krings' *On repairing texts*. (Krings 2001). Students are familiarised with the distinction between rapid, minimal and full post-editing. As defined by Allen, a rapid post-edit is "a strictly minimal editing on texts in order to remove blatant and significant errors ... stylistic issues should not be considered". The full post-edit, by contrast, aims to produce a text which is of the same quality as a professional human translation. Anything in between is classified as a minimal post-edit, which Allen describes as "a fuzzy, wide-ranging category". In a minimal post-edit, a text is edited with a specific readership in mind. The amount of editing may be quite extensive if the text is required to be of fairly high quality, or quite limited if the text's usefulness is likely to be short-lived, or if the information is more important than the style of delivery.

The students then have a practical assignment to do which involves post-editing a text and commenting on the process, and it was at this stage that students began to ask for more precise guidelines. There is a reluctance even at this level to accept that there is no one right answer, one accepted method of doing things, and they wanted to know exactly what constituted a good rapid

post-edit, exactly how much more was enough for a minimal post-edit, and so forth. While it seems to be true that there are no precise and generally accepted guidelines for various types of post-edit, it was obviously going to be useful to have a set of rules to which they could work, so we organised a discussion workshop to try to devise an operational set of our own. We concentrated on the rapid and minimal post-edits, as the full post-edit was assumed to be indistinguishable from a full high-quality translation.

We work from German into English as this is the language direction which happens to be common to all students. In the workshop I gave them a text with its raw translation, and in small groups they started the post-edit, in order to arrive at general rules from the particular cases they encountered. For this reason the text had to be longer than the ones we normally use for other aspects of MT. The texts are attached at the end of this paper and paragraph references given below refer to these texts.

Of course they rapidly arrived at the most uncontroversial changes which would have to be made in any post-edit (I do not know if Jeff Allen invented the phrase "blatant and significant errors" but I find it particularly apt). So clearly *Himmlichens* must change to *heavenly* or *divine* (paragraph 2) and the rule is easily formulated: "*Correct any word which has not been translated.*" Equally obviously *Annuitant carriage* must change to *reindeer sleigh* (paragraph 2) giving rise to the rule: "*Retranslate any word which has been incorrectly translated*" and so forth. As the students started to approach less obvious errors, however, care needed to be taken, as there was a tendency for the post-editing rules to become too detailed. They thus became unwieldy and hard to understand, and applied to so few cases that they became useless. So I had to work to keep the rules simple and generally applicable. For example, in the case of *it became coldly* > *it became cold* (paragraph 5) this came under the general heading of "*incorrectly translated*" rather than trying to make up something like: "*Correct any adjectives which have been wrongly translated as adverbs*".

The next problem which arose was that the students had a tendency to want to correct everything, and needed to be reminded that if you are going to do a complete post-edit, you might as

well translate from scratch in the first place. So in order to arrive at a minimum set of rules for a rapid post-edit, we started to refine the rules along two lines:

(i) bearing in mind how long a correction will take

(ii) bearing in mind whether a correction is necessary.

In this way I could demonstrate that we would need to refine even the most basic and obvious rules: “*Correct any word which has not been translated*” became “*Correct any word which has not been translated and does not resemble its TL equivalent*” when we considered that it was not necessary, for understanding, to change words like *Prozedere* = *procedure*, *Chorale* = *choir*, or *Shoppen* = *shopping*. Equally the rule “*retranslate any word which has been incorrectly translated*” became: “*retranslate any word which has been translated so wrongly as to make the sentence meaningless*” to take account of the fact that it is really unnecessary to change *purchase intoxication* to *shopping fever* (paragraph 4), even though the expression would not be considered acceptable in a full translation.

We then spent some time discussing the extent to which the principle of saving time by making only necessary corrections could sometimes be sacrificed to practicality. If a correction could be made with little expense of time or effort, you might as well make it. So, for example, *Grapes/clusters* can change to *clusters* (paragraph 3). A big gain in terms of text quality for very little effort. On the other hand, I had to emphasise that the time constraint is absolute, even if you have to do things sometimes against your instincts. It took students a little while to accept such controversial rules as: “*Do not tidy up the style*”. For example the phrase “*von unten rechts nach oben links*”, (paragraph 2) describing the direction Santa Claus’ sleigh takes in the neon light display, is translated “*from down right to upward left*”. While stylistically unacceptable, this is not only perfectly clear but also hard to correct. How would you explain that in clear concise English? “*From the bottom right-hand corner he rises diagonally to the left ..*” (too clumsy) “*from bottom right to top left..*” (too mathematical) “*he rises steeply into the sky..*” (too unfaithful to the original) ... some minutes of discussion on the subject of course persuaded students that we had all put in far too

much cognitive effort to make the correction efficient in terms of time spent! A similar rule along these lines was: “*Do not spend time deciding on the very best word or phrase*”. Thus the phrase “*which met it deeply in the heart*”(paragraph 3) for “*which struck to the very heart of the city*” would remain in spite of the curious image it conjured up. More controversial still was my suggestion: “*Delete anything which would take time to correct and does not add significantly to the meaning*”. Following this rule I proposed to delete the phrase, “*buying up to falling down*” (paragraph 4). It is not necessary anyway, being a retranslation of the German translation for the expression *Shop until you drop*. But it is also distracting for two reasons: firstly it takes time to work out why the phrase is there, and that the English phrase appears in the German original; and secondly, it is a rather amusing – I almost said clever – paraphrase of the original, and one could imagine spending some time discussing it. But it took a long time to persuade these students, who are doing classical translation courses in parallel to the MT course, that anything could justify simply leaving out a section of the text, given that they would be severely penalised for doing this under any other circumstances.

It proved relatively easy, however, to formulate rules for a rapid post-edit based on correcting the most obvious errors as quickly as possible. More disagreement arose over the second constraint, correcting only what was necessary, as there was no clear consensus about what was necessary. It was impossible to formulate guidelines for a minimal post-edit without asking the question “*necessary for what*”? In the end we found that the only way to get to any kind of consensus, or even realistic discussion, we had to imagine a very precise situation where the translation would be used. Still using the same text about Christmas shopping, we therefore devised a scenario in which our client, the user of the translation, is working for a business in New York and wishes to know whether the efforts to attract the overseas Christmas shoppers were being successful. In particular, how is the pre-Christmas New York shopping experience viewed by the Germans? Pressed for time in the busy run-up to the season, the client wants the article to be translated as quickly as possible in order to take it to a meeting of fellow retailers, to show that the German tourist

has a positive attitude towards the pre-Christmas shopping experience.

Immediately the whole debate about acceptability fell into sharp focus. According to this scenario, the client is in a business meeting so he does not want anything in the text which is going to waste time or be distracting. So we must add two more rules: *“Correct anything which may be comprehensible, but which takes time to work out”*. According to this rule *“the economic situation is no more crucial brake”* > *“the economic situation is not significantly slowing consumption”* (paragraph 3). Secondly, *“Correct anything which is startling or disconcerting”*. According to this rule *“gloss”* changes to *“sparkle”*(paragraph 1), and *“seduction”* to *“temptation”*(paragraph 7) in order to avoid discussion about the inappropriate negative connotations of *seduction* in this context.

In this imaginary meeting, the required translation quality demands something between the rapid and full post-edit. The client is with his fellow-retailers: they are normally, and especially at Christmas, his competitors, so he does not want to appear incompetent or silly, but for the purposes of this meeting, he is discussing a common problem with them, so he does not need to impress or persuade them. He has chosen the text and presented it to the meeting, so he is anxious that it should not sound stupid or ignorant, but equally it is clear that he has not authored the text and he is taking no responsibility for it. So the post-editor must take out anything which stands out or sounds silly, and must tidy up the word order in places to make the text read more easily, but need not worry if it still sounds a bit awkward and odd in places.

Now in fact this is as far as we got in the one-hour workshop and I attach a list of the guidelines we devised. In future years, however, I would propose to elaborate on this realistic scenario technique so as to carry out carefully defined levels of post-edit on the same text. For example, first would come the raw output as you read a text on the Internet and decided whether it is a suitable one to present to the meeting. Then a rapid post-edit as you show it to a colleague to get their opinion. After that the type of minimal post-edit we have just described, which we called “office quality”, suitable for internal discussion. Finally we could imagine that a representative of the business forum wished to report to the Mayor on the matter and a

full post-edit would be necessary in order to attach the text to the report. In reality this type of repeated treatment of the same text would involve a lot of wasted effort, but for an exercise it would demonstrate clearly different ways of treating the same MT error.

This describes the activity. To return to the ways in which the MT is assisting language learning, how is this contributing:

- to students’ language learning at an appropriate level
- to their translation skills
- to their awareness of communication
- towards giving them a perspective on realistic use of foreign languages at work?

#### 4 Post-editing and language learning

The main objections to introducing MT to language learners are that raw MT output exposes students to incorrect models and does not readily lend itself to correcting those errors. However these objections do not apply to this particular activity as we are working from the foreign language into English, which is the first language of the vast majority of the students. In this way the post-editing activity functions much like classical exercises in reading comprehension and translation. In order to post-edit effectively students must study the text in detail, thereby learning new vocabulary and expressions, new grammatical points and stylistic features. They must acquire a global understanding of the information and function of the text, as they would if they were going to answer questions for a reading comprehension; and they must also grasp the detail of sentence structure and use of vocabulary as precisely as if they were going to translate it from scratch. Far from confusing students or giving them bad habits, the post-editing exercise can actually be seen to have positive benefits for their language learning.

#### 5 Post-editing and translation skills

Here I think the exercise helps in two ways. Firstly, and most obviously, it encourages students to look at any errors and to consider and discuss the best ways of translating them. Some of the incidental discussions, like about the direction of Santa Claus’ sleigh, proved useful from the point of view of translation strategy as we talked about

accuracy, fidelity and coherence. Secondly, and perhaps unexpectedly, it can sometimes throw up some good ideas. Of course raw MT output is not normally held up as a model translation, but the fact is that there are some good versions in this example. I would find it hard to find a better version than “*the shop assistant seizes the dollar note with shapeless mittens*” (paragraph 5), which translates the German precisely and vividly. Even “*purchase intoxication*” (paragraph 4), which is a word-for-word translation of “*Kaufrausch*”, is worth a second look and bears out what some students have said about using MT in their literary translation courses, namely that they sometimes run a passage through an MT system before starting work. “It gives you ideas,” one said; “it gives you some vocabulary,” was another comment. At this level students are being encouraged to go beyond the standard dictionary definitions and I think experience improving on an MT translation can give them a bolder, more imaginative outlook and a willingness to consider a non-obvious version.

## 6 MT and communication skills

Communication skills are amongst the key transferable skills which courses in modern languages aim to develop, and from this point of view consideration of the degrees of post-editing required for different situations is very helpful to enable students to consider the function as well as the content and style of a text. It is surprising how even final-year students can have trouble recognising and articulating the differences between various communication situations and the type of language which is appropriate to each. They will happily define a text type as “literary”, “journalistic”, or “scientific” but will have much more difficulty defining what they mean by this or characterising the register of a text, and appropriate ways of expressing the same idea in different situations. Often it is only when imagining themselves in a particular situation and comparing the appropriate language that they suddenly become aware of it. Our very detailed scenarios for the business meetings function well in this way and students are more easily able to imagine the type of changes which will be necessary to the text in order to prepare it for a particular readership.

## 7 MT and languages at work

The distinction between academic and vocational education is a very important one and it is a pity that the debate is often blurred by automatic judgments and strong feelings on one side or the other. On the one hand the proponents of a more theoretical approach to syllabus design minimise the importance of developing practical marketable skills. They equate any attempt to improve students’ employability with an attempt to reduce the intellectual rigour of their courses, and reject anything which appears to place constraints on their freedom to decide what they should or should not include. They feel that teachers should train the student to think clearly and to develop a fearless intellectual curiosity, to equip them to be able to apply themselves to anything. Teachers of philosophy or classics tend to this point of view; language courses run along these lines tend to the literary and cultural options, the short, rigorously accurate and creative translations, the tightly argued essay and the structured oral presentation. On the other hand are the teachers of applied disciplines who point out with equal justice that a course of study which has divorced itself from the practice of the subject in the real world is worse than useless to its students. It would be hard to imagine university courses in social work, for example, or agriculture, let alone medicine, which were not informed by the latest practices in these areas and did not give their students practical experience. Language courses of this type will include the more practical tasks like report writing, gist translation and consecutive interpreting skills.

I believe that in the case of machine translation we have an opportunity to create a course which sits very comfortably between these two imperatives, and again the post-editing work we are doing illustrates this. On the one hand the workshop lends itself to discussion of the most abstract principles which underlie the authoring and translating process, by forcing consideration of the human/machine translation divide; on the other hand it gives students their first experience of one of the most practical skills which trainee translators can be expected to acquire.

I am not suggesting of course that our invented scenario actually bears much relation to a real post-editing task. In fact I have not attempted to align our course content too closely to a real-world

translation environment, for two reasons. Firstly it is very hard to fit in anything like a real post-editing task into the very small number of hours available to us. It is not possible to reproduce in the classroom the kind of large-scale, often repetitive work which would give students a real idea of what it is really like. Secondly, when we are only giving an introduction to the subject, it may be confusing and misleading to look too closely at how these tasks are actually sometimes carried out. I would have liked to give our students some exposure to real post-editing work, but after a visit to a local translation company I decided against it. The work being done involved post-editing of technical documentation produced by a team of translators with the help of a translation memory system. However the post-editing environment was far from the carefully constructed scenario with which we had been working. The company was simply struggling with too many practical difficulties. The communication between members of the team was poor, the company was understaffed relative to the volume of work, and the translation memory database was not maintained, which meant that the individual post-editor was faced with impossibly conflicting guidelines as to how to proceed on any particular case. It would hardly have been fair to expect my students, still familiarising themselves with rules to be applied in clear and ideal circumstances, to make any sense of this type of situation in the time

available. After all we are teaching, not training. I would like to hope, however, that our course, balanced between the ideal of theory and the realities of practice, would enable students to recognise and deal with these difficulties as soon as they find themselves in their first job.

### **Bibliographical References:**

- Allen, Jeffrey. 2003. Post-editing. Chapter in H. Somers (ed) *Computers and Translation: a Translator's Guide*, John Benjamins, Amsterdam, Netherlands.
- Belam, Judith. 2002. Teaching MT evaluation by assessed project work. 6<sup>th</sup> EAMT workshop, *Teaching Machine Translation*. EAMT/BCS, Manchester, UK
- Krings, Hans, translated and edited by Koby, G.S. 2001. *Repairing texts: empirical investigations of machine translation post-editing processes*. Kent State UP, Ohio, USA
- Lewis, Derek. 1997. Machine Translation in a Modern Languages Curriculum. *Computer Assisted Language Learning* 10. Intellect, Oxford, UK.
- O'Brien, Sharon. 2002. Teaching Post-editing, a proposal for course content. 6<sup>th</sup> EAMT workshop, *Teaching Machine Translation*. EAMT/BCS, Manchester, UK
- Somers, Harold. 2001. Three Perspectives on MT in the classroom. *Workshop on Teaching Machine Translation*, MT Summit XIII, IAMT/EAMT, Santiago de Compostela, Spain

## Appendix 1: Texts

### German original

Christmas Shopping in NYC

**(1) Lange trug New York Trauer – In der Vorweihnacht sind Glanz, Stimmung und Jingle-Bells-Atmosphäre zurückgekehrt. Die Szene mit Shops, Restaurants und Bars hat sich allerdings mal wieder gründlich verändert**

(2) Der Weihnachtsmann hebt ab, das der rote Mantel wie ein Drache flattert. Und das immer wieder. Wie von himmlischen Kräften getragen, fliegt der Rentierschlitten durchs Schaufenster, von unten rechts nach oben links, den Goldenen Sternen entgegen. Leise rieselt der Kunstschnee.

(3) Trauben von happy Shopping-Touristen vor dem Kaufhaus stimmen mit den Füßen ab, bleiben ohne Ende staunend stehen.  
Ja, so lieben sie New York in der Vorweihnacht. Die Mega-City zwischen Hudson und East River funkelt wieder wie vor den Anschlägen, die sie tief ins Herz trafen. In diesen Tagen ist selbst die stotternde Konjunktur keine entscheidende Bremse mehr.

(4) Die New Yorker müssen diesen Spruch „Shop till you drop“, „Einkaufen bis zum Umfallen“, erfunden haben. Die Geschäfte sind voll, der Kaufrausch ist zurückgekehrt, unter den diamantenen Lichtern im Art déco-Diadem des Chrysler Buildings.

(5) Es ist kalt in der Stadt, so richtig kalt geworden. Die Verkäuferin, die mir, dick verhummt, die heiße Brezel vom Rollwagen verkauft, greift mit unförmigen Faustlingen die Dollar-Note. Ein Pferd, das im Strom der Autos eine Kutsche zieht, schnaubt kleine weiße Wolken. Am Rockefeller-Center wärmt gleißende Pracht zumindest die Herzen. In diesem Epizentrum des vorweihnachtlichen New York war Ende November mit einem Sattelschlepper die in Kanada gefällte Riesentanne angeliefert worden. Als der Bürgermeister den Stecker in die Dose steckte, leuchteten 26 000 Lichter am größten Weihnachtsbaum der Welt. Das gleiche Prozedere wie in jedem Jahr.

(6) New York zum Schauen, Erleben, ja natürlich vor allem Shoppen. Wir setzen Bloomingdale's, Saks Fifth Avenue, Macy's als bekannt voraus und geben Ihnen neue Empfehlungen, auch für den Genuss und günstige Hotels, um den Geldbeutel zu schonen. Kurzfristig gibt es drei und viertägige New York-Angebote der Airlines und Veranstalter bereits um die 600 Euro mit Flug und Hotel.

(7) Bei der Verführung zum Kauf in Plüsch und Pomp wurde an alles gedacht. Auf den Straßen werden Choräle von Met-Mitgliedern gesungen (die Geschäftsleute zahlen), Kaufhäuser in der Fifth Avenue sind mit roten Schleifen zu riesigen Geschenkpaketen verschnürt, und himmlische Einheiten von goldenen Engeln aus Golddraht und Lichterketten komplettieren das Bild. Spaß am Shopping ist nirgendwo so festlich und verrückt wie auf New Yorks goldener Meile.

## **Christmas Shopping in NYC**

**(1) For a long time New York mourning carried- gloss, tendency and Jingle Bells atmosphere in the Vorweihnacht returned. The scene with Shops, restaurants and Bars changed however times again thoroughly.**

**(2)** Santa Claus takes off, which the red coat flutters like a Drache. And that again and again. As carried by himmlischen forces, the annuitant carriage flies by the shop window, from down right upward left, the golden stars against. Quietly the art snow rieselt.

**(3)** Grapes/clusters of happy Shopping tourists before the department store co-ordinate with the feet, stop without end being astonished. Yes, then they love New York in the Vorweihnacht. The megatown center between Hudson and East River sparkles again as before the notices, which met it deeply in the heart. In these days even the stotternde economic situation is no more crucial brake.

**(4)** The New Yorker ones must have invented this saying “Shop till you drop”, “buying up to falling down”. The business is full, the purchase intoxication returned, under the diamond lights in the Artdéco artdéco-Diadem of the Chrysler Buildings.

**(5)** It became coldly in the city, so correctly cold. The shop assistant, who vermunmt me, thickly, the hot brezel sold by the truck, seizes the dollar note with shapeless mittens. A horse, which pulls a kutsche in the river of the cars, schnaubt small white clouds. At the skirt skin he center track-sends splendour warms at least the hearts. In this epizentrum at the end of had been delivered to vorweihnachtlichen New York November with a semi-trailer the giant fir gefaellte in Canada. When the mayor put the plug into the box, 26,000 lights at the largest Christmas tree of the world shone. The same Prozedere as in each year.

**(6)** New York for looking, experiencing, naturally above all Shoppen. We expect Bloomingdale’s, Saks Fifth Avenue, Macy’s to be familiar and give you new recommendations, also for the benefit and favorable hotels, in order to preserve the purse. There are already at short notice three and four-day new York offers of the airlines and organizers around the 600 euro with flight and hotel.

**(7)** With the seduction to the purchase in pluesch and Pomp of everything one thought. Sung on the roads Chorale of Met members (the businessmen to pay), department stores in the Fifth Avenue are tied with red loops to enormous gift packages, and himmlische units of golden angels from gold lead and candlelight demonstrations complete the picture. Fun at the Shopping is nowhere as festive and moved as on new Yorks of golden mile.



## English translation

**(1) New York wore mourning for a long time. – But in the run-up to Christmas the sparkle, the high spirits and the Jingle-bells atmosphere have returned. The scene, with shops, restaurants and bars, has changed completely once again.**

(2) Santa Claus takes off, his red coat fluttering like a dragon's wing. Over and over again. As if pulled by heavenly powers, the reindeer sleigh flies up across the shop window from right to left against a background of golden stars. The artificial snow drifts gently down.

(3) Tight groups of happy tourist shoppers walk around together or stand and stare in endless amazement. Yes, that's how they love New York in the Christmas season. The great metropolis between the Hudson and the East River is glittering again, just like before the events of September 11<sup>th</sup>, which struck to the very heart of the city. These days even the shaky economic situation is not significantly slowing consumption.

(4) New Yorkers must have invented the phrase "Shop until you drop". The shops are full and shopping fever is back under the diamond lights of the art-deco diadem of the Chrysler Building.

(5) It has got cold in the city, really cold. The salesgirl who sold me a pretzel from a street stand was well wrapped up and seized the dollar note with shapeless mittens. A horse, pulling a carriage through the stream of traffic, breathes out little white clouds. At the Rockefeller Center the glittering splendour is at least heartwarming. Here at the end of November, at the epicentre of New York's Christmas celebrations, an articulated lorry delivered the giant fir tree, felled in Canada. When the Mayor put the plug in the socket, 26 000 lights lit up on the biggest Christmas tree in the world. Just the same as any other year.

(6) There is plenty to look at in New York, plenty to experience, but above all it is for shopping. We take it you know Bloomingdale's, Saks Fifth Avenue, Macy's, and we have new recommendations to make, places to eat, comfortable hotels, to protect your wallet. At the moment airlines and tour operators are offering three- to four-day excursions to New York with flight and hotel for around 600 euros.

(7) In the midst of luxury and splendour, they have thought of everything to tempt you. On the streets the choir of the Metropolitan Opera are singing (the retailers pay the fees). The department stores of Fifth Avenue are tied into giant parcels with red bows, and groups of golden angels made of gold wire and strings of lights complete the picture. Only the wild festivities of New York's golden mile can make your shopping trip this much fun.

## Appendix 2: Post-editing guidelines

**For a rapid post-edit, in general: correct only blatant and significant errors.**

### Do:

- correct any word which has not been translated and does not resemble its TL equivalent. Thus: *himmlischen* > *divine* or *heavenly*
- correct any word which has been translated so wrongly as to make the sentence meaningless. Thus: *annuitant carriage* > *reindeer sleigh*
- delete anything which is confusing, which may take time to correct, and which does not add or detract significantly from the meaning. Thus *Buying up to falling down* is deleted.

### Don't:

- change the word order if the meaning is not affected. Thus *the golden stars against* does not change to: *against the golden stars*.
- Change a word which has been wrongly translated, but which still has a related meaning. Thus *the purchase intoxication returned* does not change to *shopping fever returned*.
- Tidy up the style. Thus *And that again and again* does not change to *over and over again*.

**For a minimal post-edit, in general: correct anything which stands out, or is disconcerting.**

### Do:

- change a startling choice to something more bland or appropriate. Thus *seduction* > *temptation*
- Change the word order to make the text flow more easily. Thus *the golden stars against* > *against the golden stars*.
- Change sentence structure where necessary to increase ease of comprehension. For example, split long sentences into shorter ones, or change a noun construction to a verbal one: *the economic situation is no more crucial brake* > *the economic situation is not significantly slowing consumption*.

### Don't:

- spend a long time deciding on the very best word or phrase.
- attempt to make the translation sound like a piece of original writing.